JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

70. THOMAS EDWARD DAVIDSON V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY BY SEPARATE OPINION.

71. DARRIN WALKER V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM –
AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2016-SC-000032-MR TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON**

OBLISHED

Questions Presented:

14 counts of First Degree Robbery, PFO I-30 years. Failing to sever the robbery offenses was not error. Permitting 3 police officers to testify that in their opinion the robberies were all related to each other was harmless error. KRE 701. Trial judge's comment informing the jury of the ruling that both defendants should be tried together on all charges did not constitute palpable error.

2016-SC-000594-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

KENTON

Questions Presented:

4 Counts of First-Degree Sodomy and First-Degree Rape-Life. Right to confront witnesses was not violated when the prosecutor, with the court's permission, used a television cart to block him from viewing the upset minor victim during trial; such action was not unduly burdensome to the rights of the defendant. KRS 26A.140. Court rulings on evidentiary issues, regarding witness testimony; KRE 404(b), jail phone calls and bolstering testimony, upheld.

72. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **V.** B. H.

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE KELLER – AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; CUNNINGHAM, HUGHES, KELLER, VENTERS AND WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. VANMETER, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. **2017-SC-000155-DG TO BE PUBLISHED**

JEFFERSON

Questions Presented:

Juvenile Law. Competency. Jurisdiction. KRS 635.020(4). District court has jurisdiction to conduct a competency hearing regarding a 14-year old who allegedly committed murder and first-degree robbery.

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 73. COREY M. JETER V.
 COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY
 JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM –
 AFFIRMING
 ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 74. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. KYLE D. THOMPSON

 OPINION OF THE COURT BY

 JUSTICE HUGHES –

 AFFIRMING AND REMANDING

 MINTON, C.J.; CUNNINGHAM,

 KELLER, AND VENTERS, JJ.,

 CONCUR. VANMETER, J., CONCURS
 IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART
 BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH

 WRIGHT, J., JOINS.
- 75. BAUMANN PAPER CO., INC. V.
 KENNETH HOLLAND
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY
 JUSTICE WRIGHT –
 AFFIRMING AND REMANDING
 ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.;
 CUNNINGHAM, VANMETER,
 VENTERS, AND WRIGHT JJ.,
 CONCUR. HUGHES, KELLER, JJ.,
 CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY.

<u>2017-SC-000232-DG</u> JEFFERSON **TO BE PUBLISHED**

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Bond Increase Post-Indictment. Application of Bail Credit. Trial court may increase pretrial bond set in district court.

2016-SC-000365-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **HARDIN**

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Ineffective assistance of counsel. Advice on a guilty plea. Ineffective assistance of counsel when counsel fails to advise their client, who intends to plead guilty to the crime of attempted kidnapping of a minor, that they will also be required to register as a sex offender. Remanded for a determination of whether said failure by counsel prejudiced the defendant.

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions

FAYETTE

Questions Presented:

Contracts. Statute of Frauds. Unjust enrichment. Enforceability of an agreement to provide future benefits in lieu of a retirement plan, which though signed by the employee was never executed by the employer.

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

76. AUSLANDER PROPERTIES, LLC. V. JOSEPH HERMAN NALLEY, ET AL. **OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE VENTERS -REVERSING**

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

77. ROBERT KEITH WOODALL V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON -REVERSING AND REMANDING** MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, VANMETER, VENTERS AND WRIGHT, JJ., SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, VANMETER, AND VENTERS CONCUR. WRIGHT, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION. CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.

78. CINDY MUNCIE. ET AL. V. PATRICIA WIESEMANN **OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM – REVERSING AND REMANDING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2016-SC-000099-DG **NELSON** TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Negligence Per Se. KOSHA/OSHA. Property Management Companies. Whether a small property rental company was required to comply with KOSHA/OSHA fall prevention regulations when it hired an independent contractor to trim trees at one of its properties.

2017-SC-000171-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

CALDWELL

Questions Presented:

Preclusion of the Imposition of the Death Penalty upon Intellectually Disabled Persons. KRS 532.130(2) declared to be unconstitutional.

2017-SC-000235-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

OLDHAM

Questions Presented:

Environmental Law. Stigma Damages to Property. Whether and to what extent a property owner may be entitled to additional damages beyond costs of remediation for stigma attaching to property because of an environmental injury.

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

79. KAREN MARTIN DOYLE, ETC. V.
JAMES SAMUEL DOYLE, ETC.
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE KELLER –
REVERSING AND REMANDING
ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.;
HUGHES, KELLER, VENTERS AND
WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. VANMETER,
J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.
CUNNINGHAM, J., DISSENTS BY
SEPARATE OPINION.

2017-SC-000358-DGE KNOTT TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Family Law. Interest on money judgment. KRS 360.040. Application of KRS 360.040, governing interest on a judgment in a domestic relations case.

80. MELVIN HENSLEY, ET AL. V.
HAYNES TRUCKING, LLC, ET AL
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON –
REVERSING AND REINSTATING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2016-SC-000180-DG FAYETTE TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Class Actions. Public Works Contracts. Nonpayment of Prevailing Wages. Whether a class action may be brought alleging a failure to pay prevailing wages to workers on qualifying public works project.

81. WARREN FRYER V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT – AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2016-SC-000557-MR HARDIN NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

82. JOSHUA RATLIFF V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT – AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2017-SC-000271-MR HARDIN NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

83. WILLIAM CALHOUN V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT – AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2017-SC-000369-MR TAYLOR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

84. FIRST CLASS SERVICES, INC. V. 2017-SC-000620-WC FROM COURT NOT TO BE PUBLISHED OF APPEALS GURAL W. HENSLEY, ET AL. **MEMORANDUM OPINION OF** THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

85. PHILLIP J. THOMPSON V. **CLAY** 2017-SC-000169-MR COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED MEMORANDUM OPINION OF** THE COURT - AFFIRMING IN PART. **VACATING IN PART, AND REMANDING** ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES VENTERS AND VANMETER, JJ.,

CONCUR. KELLER, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION WHICH

CUNNINGHAM AND WRIGHT, JJ., JOIN.

86. JOHN MILLS V. 2018-SC-000128-OA **IN SUPREME** HON. STEPHEN JONES, SPECIAL NOT TO BE PUBLISHED COURT JUDGE KNOX CIRCUIT COURT, ET AL. **MEMORANDUM OPINION OF**

THE COURT - DENYING PETITION FOR WRIT OF PROHIBITION AND WRIT OF

MANDAMUS.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

OPINION AND ORDER – JUNE 6, 2018

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. 2017-SC-000314-DG ROWAN

GEORGE SAMUEL FULTZ

ORDER GRANTED DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. THE COURT OF APPEALS DECISION IS **VACATED AND THE CASE IS REMANDED TO** THE COURT OF APPEALS FOR FURTHER CONSIDERATION IN LIGHT OF THIS COURT'S RECENT DECISION IN COMMONWEALTH V. MOORE, 2016-SC-000275-DG, (FINAL MAY 17, 2018).

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

OPINION AND ORDERS – JUNE 14, 2018

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. RICHARD GRAHAM KENNISTON ORDER OF INDEFINITE SUSPENSION. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2018-SC-000069-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. MYRA DESHAWN CHENAULT ORDER OF SUSPENSION FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 4 YEARS, WITH FINA 18 MONTHS PROBATED, WITH CONDITIONS. KELLER, VANMETER, VENTERS, WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. HUGHES, J., DISSENTS TO THE EXTENT THAT SHE WOULD NOT PROBATE ANY PORTION OF THE FOUR- YEAR SENTENCE, IN WHICH MINTON, C.J. JOINS. CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.	2018-SC-000081-KB TO BE PUBLISHED AL	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. DENNIS MICHAEL STUTSMAN ORDER OF SUSPENSION FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 181 DAYS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2018-SC-000100-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. DANIEL ALAN NIEHAUS ORDER OF PERMANENT DISBARMENT. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2018-SC-000148-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. DAMIAN GALLAHER ORDER OF PERMANENT DISBARMENT. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2018-SC-000160-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
SEAN PATRICK PARIS V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER TO GRANT RESTORATION. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR	2018-SC-000200-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

OPINION AND ORDERS – JUNE 14, 2018

CHARLES FREDERICK MERZ V.	<u>2018-SC-000208-KB</u>	IN SUPREME
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION	TO BE PUBLISHED	COURT
ORDER OF PUBLIC REPRIMAND.		
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.		

CAROL GREISSMAN V. RAWLINGS AND ASSOCIATES, PLLC.	2017-SC-000518-DG	OLDHAM
DONALD G. ADAMS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2017-SC-000599-DG	DAVIESS
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. JOHN P. ROTH, JR.	2018-SC-000095-DG	CAMPBELL
JOHN B. BAUGHMAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT CABINET, ET AL.	2018-SC-000104-DG	FRANKLIN
RICHARD A. GETTY, ET AL. V. BRENDA SUE BRIDGES GETTY, ET AL. VANMETER, J., NOT SITTING.	2018-SC-000111-DG	BOURBON
ALGER FERGUSON V . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000151-DG	LAWRENCE
DONNA KRIEGER, ET AL. V. TAMARA D. GARVIN, ET AL.	2018-SC-000154-DGE	JEFFERSON

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

GRAND LODGE OF KENTUCKY FREE AND ACCEPTED MASONS, ET AL. V. CITY OF TAYLOR MILL, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, VANMETER AND VENTERS, JJ., AND CHARLES D. WALTE AND KIMBERLY F. MCCANN, SPECIAL JUSTICES, SITTING.	•	KENTON
JAMES STOLL BEARDMORE V. JPMORGAN CHASE BANK THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED. VANMETER, J., NOT SITTING.	2017-SC-000215-D	FAYETTE
ADRIAN BENTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2017-SC-000410-D	FAYETTE
LARRY R. ORDWAY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2017-SC-000413-D	CHRISTIAN
CHARLES R. ROMANS V. DOUG JOHNSON, ET AL. VENTERS, J., WOULD GRANT.	2017-SC-000414-D	OLDHAM
DELORIS GEISLER V. KENTUCKY COMMUNITY AND TECHNICAL COLLEGE SYSTEM	2017-SC-000449-D	JEFFERSON
PAUL WILLIAM MARTIN V. SAORI HANAKI	2017-SC-000452-D	FAYETTE
MARCHON HORSE FARM, LP, ET AL. V. FIFTH THIRD BANK, NA VENTERS, J., WOULD GRANT.	2017-SC-000464-D	FAYETTE
T. Y. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2017-SC-000465-D	JEFFERSON

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

LLOYD P. SORRELS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2017-SC-000472-D	MUHLENBERG
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. MACK TACKETT THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED. WRIGHT, J., NOT SITTING.	2017-SC-000535-D	PIKE
JOHN RAAP V. JAMELLE TAYLOR VANMETER AND VENTERS, JJ., WOULD GRANT.	2017-SC-000539-D	JEFFERSON
AKEEM DONTAE HOWARD-JONES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER AND VENTERS, JJ., WOULD GRANT.	2017-SC-000559-D	FAYETTE
CHARLIE COLEMAN, ET AL. V. CAMPBELL COUNTY PUBLIC LIBRARY BOARD OF TRUSTEES	2018-SC-000048-D	CAMPBELL
DEWEY LYNN STRICKLER, ET AL. V. TOMMY B. MAYES AND	2018-SC-000050-D	SIMPSON
PNC BANK, NATIONAL ASSOCIATION V. TOMMY B. MAYES VANMETER, J., WOULD GRANT.	2018-SC-000057-D	SIMPSON
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. LAURA SUSANNE PIKE AND	2018-SC-000052-D	HENRY
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. BRETT A. SMITH VANMETER AND WRIGHT, JJ., WOULD GRANT.	2018-SC-000053-D	HENRY

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

AARON K. HILL V. CMCO MORTGAGE, LLC.	2018-SC-000068-D	JEFFERSON
KENNETH R. REED, ET AL. V. CITIZENS BANK, N.A. F/K/A RBS CITIZENS, ET AL. KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2018-SC-000071-D	KENTON
MARKELLE D. WHITE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000076-D	JEFFERSON
BRIDGETT WRIGHT V. RUSSELL A. SWIGART, ET AL.	2018-SC-000089-D	KENTON
KELLER COTITA V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE COMMISSION	2018-SC-000099-D	JEFFERSON
GHIAS ARAR V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000101-D	JEFFERSON
DAMON L. SHANKLIN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000103-D	JEFFERSON
DIANNE M. LYVERS, F/K/A DIANNE CLARK, ET AL. V. CAROLYN MILES HILTON	2018-SC-000106-D	NELSON
DEBORAH CHEN MARR V. AGNES MARIA BELLAMY, ET AL.	2018-SC-000107-D	BREATHITT
WILLIAM LAMB V. JACKIE T. STRODE	2018-SC-000109-D	WARREN
RICHARD T. WAN, M.D. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, BOARD OF MEDICAL LICENSURE	2018-SC-000110-D	JEFFERSON

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

STANLEY STOKES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000113-D	MCCRACKEN
JOHN SCOTT BENTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000117-D	FAYETTE
RUFUS ANTONIO HODGES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000125-D	JEFFERSON
ROBIN MOORE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000130-D	JEFFERSON
JEFFREY STEWART V. KATHY LITTERAL, ET AL. VENTERS, J., WOULD GRANT.	2018-SC-000134-D	HARLAN
TAMARA SLUSS V. ESTATE OF GLORIA B. SLUSS, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2018-SC-000135-D	BOYD
LAWRENCE CENTLIVER V. JEANNETTE CENTLIVER	2018-SC-000137-D	MADISON
WILL HARROD, ET AL. V. KATHLEEN CANEY VANMETER, J., WOULD GRANT.	2018-SC-000143-D	FRANKLIN
LA TONYA MOORMAN, ET AL. V. LOUISVILLE METRO HOUSING AUTHORITY DEVELOPMENT CORP., ET AL.	2018-SC-000145-D	JEFFERSON
TIMOTHY WAYNE CRAWFORD V. MAGNUM HUNTER PRODUCTION, INC.	2018-SC-000156-D	KNOX
TERRY BUCHANAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2018-SC-000157-D	FLEMING

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

<u>COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – JUNE 6, 2018</u>

ESTATE OF GENEVA ADAMS **V.** 2018-SC-000158-D HOPKINS PHILIP C. TROVER, ET AL.

GERALD WEST V. 2018-SC-000167-D CAMPBELL

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

BRIAN P. EPPERSON V. 2018-SC-000168-D POWELL

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

WRIGHT, J., NOT SITTING.

MICHAEL MUSARRA, SR. V. 2018-SC-000172-D WEBSTER

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

<u>COURT ORDER DENYING BELATED MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME TO FILE</u> MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – JUNE 8, 2018

RANDAL KIPER V. 2018-SC-000114-D OHIO

CITICANS BANK

WRIGHT, HUGHES, KELLER AND VENTERS,

JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

COURT ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO TRANSFER

STATE OF OHIO AND JOSEPH W. TESTA, 2018-SC-000161-TG GREENUP

TAX COMMISSIONER OF OHIO V. GREAT LAKES MINERALS, LLC. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ENTERED: JUNE 14, 2018

COURT ORDER DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING – JUNE 14, 2018

KEVIN FRANKLIN V. 2016-SC-000330-MR JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

JUNE 14, 2018 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS DISMISSING

MICHAEL FOWLER V. 2016-SC-000333-MR BUTLER

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ENTERED: MAY 21, 2018

KINDRED HEALTHCARE, INC., ET AL. V. 2016-SC-000628-D DAVIESS

ARTIE CHEROLIS, AS EXECUTRIX OF THE ESTATE OF THELMA FUQUA, DECEASED

WRIGHT, HUGHES, KELLER AND VENTERS,

JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ENTERED: JUNE 7, 2018

BAPTIST HEALTHCARE SYSTEM, INC., 2017-SC-000637-MR WHITLEY

ETC. V.

HON. PAUL K. WINCHESTER, JUDGE,

WHITLEY CIRCUIT COURT, DIVISION TWO,

ET AL.

WRIGHT, HUGHES, KELLER AND VENTERS,

JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ENTERED: JUNE 7, 2018

MARK ANTHONY WILLIAMS V. 2018-SC-000062-D MASON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ENTERED: MAY 8, 2018

GARY WARICK V. 2018-SC-000132-D FLOYD

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ENTERED: APRIL 25, 2018

COURT ORDERS PERMITTING MOVANT TO WITHDRAW AS A MEMBER OF THE KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

GREGORY WARD V. 2018-SC-000218-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

ENTERED: MAY 3, 2018

MICHAEL REDMOND HURTER V. 2018-SC-000240-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

ENTERED: MAY 17, 2018