#### MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 19. JIMMY R. GIBSON, ET AL. V. RANDY THOMPSON **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM -**DENYING MOTION FOR** INTERLOCUTORY RELIEF ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 20. HON. WILLIAM MITCHELL NANCE. CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE, 43RD JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, DIVISION TWO (FAMILY COURT), COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. KENTUCKY ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF THE COURTS **OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE -**ABRAMSON, J., ALSO CONCURS BY SEPARATE OPINION. SCHRODER, J. DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION. MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING.

#### 2010-SC-000708-I TO BE PUBLISHED

**KNOTT** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Denial of Motion for Interlocutory Relief. Standing to challenge qualifications of a candidate in a primary election.

2010-SC-000202-OA TO BE PUBLISHED

IN SUPREME COURT

#### **Questions Presented:**

Power of local court officials to appoint the personnel in their offices exists through the policy of the Supreme Court. When that grant of appointing authority is not properly executed in the best interest of the Court of Justice by the local officials, the Chief Justice must act, either directly or by proper delegation of his authority.

21. KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS V. **DILLARD WAYNE BROWN** (INDIVIDUALLY AND AS EXECUTOR OF THE ESTATE OF BARBARA FAYE REED BROWN, DECEASED) **AND** KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS V. TAMMY SIZEMORE **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE SCOTT -**AFFIRMING** 

NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT

ONLY.

2008-SC-000326-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

FRANKLIN

2008-SC-000898-DG 2009-SC-000174-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

**FRANKLIN FRANKLIN** 

## **Questions Presented:**

Kentucky Administrative Law. Disability Retirement. Issues include whether courts below improperly shifted burden of proof regarding disability-retirement applicant's alleged pre-existing condition and usurped the role of the fact-finder; and whether applicant's history of cigarette-smoking constituted a preexisting "condition" for purposes of KRS61.600(3).

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

JOSEPH FISCHER, ET AL. V.
JOHN R. FISCHER, SUCCESSOR
EXECUTOR OF THE ESTATE
OF JOHN FISCHER
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE NOBLE –
AFFIRMING
SCHRODER AND SCOTT, JJ.,
CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY.

23. JAMES QUISENBERRY V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
AND
KENNETH WILLIAMS V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE ABRAMSON –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000245-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

**JEFFERSON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Preservation. Contract Law. Issues include whether Court of Appeals' reversal of jury verdict was appropriate where the grounds for reversal were not raised in the trial court.

2009-SC-000302-MR JEFFERSON

TO BE PUBLISHED

2009-SC-000418-MR JEFFERSON TO BE PUBLISHED

#### **Questions Presented:**

Joint trial in which co-defendants were found guilty of robbery, murder and second degree manslaughter, assault and attempted murder, facilitation and tampering with physical evidence. No error in admitting defendants' redacted pretrial statements in their joint trial. A limiting instruction should be given by the judge upon defendant's request; if not requested, review is limited to palpable error analysis. Defendant's ambiguous statements did not invoke rights under Miranda and Edwards. Convictions supported by sufficient evidence. Convictions for facilitating assault and attempted murder did not constitute double jeopardy.

24. GERALD S. HINNERS V.
BRAD ROBEY, D/B/A/ ROBEY'S
PAWN WORLD
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000389-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **KENTON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Personal Jurisdiction. eBay. The issue is whether a seller - located in another state - who sells a product to a buyer in Kentucky through eBay has significant contacts with the state to establish personal jurisdiction when the buyer sues for fraud and defective product.

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

25. DENVER RAY WILLIAMS V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON –
AFFIRMING

NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT
ONLY BECAUSE APPELLANT
POSSESSED TWO DIFFERENT
QUANTITIES OF COCAINE, WHICH
WERE SUFFICIENT TO SUPPORT
TWO DIFFERENT CONVICTIONS
WITHOUT VIOLATING KRS 505.020
OR DOUBLE JEOPARDY PRINCIPLES.

26. JOHNATHAN HARRIS V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

27. DUWAN LAMAR ROBBINS V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM –
AFFIRMING

NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.

2009-SC-000440-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **HARDIN** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Double Jeopardy. Ineffective Assistance of Counsel. Issues include whether trial counsel was ineffective for failing to object to a second count of trafficking, based upon defendant's attempted swallowing of small baggie of contraband.

2009-SC-000621-MR TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON** 

## **Questions Presented:**

Second degree PFO. Section 110 (5)(b) authorizes the Chief Justice to appoint retired judges from the senior status program to preside over trials. Defendant became PFO eligible when he turned twenty-one before the time of his conviction.

2009-SC-000643-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Discovery. Expert Witnesses. Search and Seizure. Identity of Confidential Informant. Forfeiture. The issues include whether the lower courts properly affirmed the warrantless search; whether the lower courts properly forfeited the money found on the defendant's person; the extent to which parties must disclose information regarding expert witnesses and the basis for their opinions, and the circumstances under which the trial court must compel the identity of the confidential informant.

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

28. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **V.** RAYCINE LOVE

OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON – AFFIRMING

SCOTT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS.

29. VELESSA HATHAWAY V.
AUDRA J. ECKERLE (JUDGE,
JEFFERSON CIRCUIT COURT)
AND
COMMONWEALTH DODGE, LLC
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

30. CAESARS RIVERBOAT CASINO, LLC, ET AL. V.
CARLA BEACH
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
REVERSING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000671-DG

**MCCRACKEN** 

### TO BE PUBLISHED

#### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Sentencing. Probation Revocation. Where probationer under Kentucky felony sentence committed federal felony offense, Kentucky authorities lodged detainer for probation violation within 90 days after federal sentencing, and Kentucky probation was revoked after defendant's release from federal prison, issues include whether trial court properly ordered Kentucky sentence to be served consecutively to federal sentence, in light of KRS 533.040(3) and KRS 533.060(2).

**2010-SC-000457-MR TO BE PUBLISHED** 

**JEFFERSON** 

#### POBLISHED

Arbitration clause in vehicle purchase agreement. Jurisdiction. Revocation.

**Questions Presented:** 

2009-SC-000634-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

**SHELBY** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Personal Jurisdiction. Minimum Contacts. The issue is whether Kentucky long-arm personal jurisdiction extends to include out-of-state casino corporations, in whose Indiana restaurant buffet line a frequent patron from Kentucky suffered injury after allegedly slipping on butter and falling to the floor.

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

31. CAROLYN RICE V.
JACKIE RICE
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE NOBLE –
REVERSING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000730-DG GREENUP TO BE PUBLISHED

#### **Questions Presented:**

Family Law. Divorce. Division of Debt. At issue is proper allocation of debt accrued by adult child as authorized user of one spouse's credit card, without the permission or knowledge of the other spouse.

32. GEORGE LAPRADD, JR. V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE SCHRODER –
REVERSING AND REMANDING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000214-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Jury Instructions. Justification. Choice of Evils. At issue is whether a finding of a lack of justification based upon choice of evils should be included in the instruction for the crime itself.

33. LOWELL WORKMAN,
ET AL. V.
J. P. HAMM, IN HIS OFFICIAL
CAPACITY AS THE APPOINTING
AUTHORITY FOR THE CABINET
FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY
SERVICES, ET AL.
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000522-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED **FRANKLIN** 

34. JAMES SPARKS V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000610-MR
NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

GREENUP

## **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

35.	CYNTHIA WALLACE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000659-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FAYETTE
36.	JONATHAN LEVI JOHNSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000727-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
37.	ANTHONY WIDEMAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000025-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
38.	BETTS USA, INC. V. DEBBIE MURSKI; ET AL. AND DEBBIE MURSKI V. BETTS USA, INC.; ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000203-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED  2010-SC-000221-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS

## **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

39.	JOHN J. SIEGEL, JR., ET AL. V. HONORABLE AUDRA ECKERLE JUDGE, JEFFERSON CIRCUIT COURT, DIVISION SEVEN, ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000254-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
40.	KENIELLE FINCH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., DISSENT.	2010-SC-000267-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
41.	HARRISON MEMORIAL HOSPITAL V. GARY SIPE, ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000287-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS
42.	JAMES RISTER V. SCRUBET, INC.; ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000296-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	
43.	ROBERT ROBINSON V. DAVE GATEWOOD, ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING VENTERS, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS.	2010-SC-000354-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

44. AMERICAN NURSING CARE, INC. V. MARY ANN JENKINS, ET AL. NOT TO BE PUBLISHED OF APPEALS

MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

45. RICHARD CROTZER V.
CWI, ET AL.
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

PROM COURT
NOT TO BE PUBLISHED
OF APPEALS
OF APPEALS

**JEFFERSON** 

46. TAYLOR BANKS V.
HON. BARRY L. WILLETT, JUDGE,
JEFFERSON CIRCUIT COURT,
DIVISION ONE
AND
JAMES WILLIAMS, JR.
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF

**AFFIRMING** 

THE COURT -

ABRAMSON, J., ALSO CONCURS WITH THE MAJORITY OPINION FOR THE REASON THAT APPELLANT BANKS HAS NOT MET THE COURT'S STANDARD REQUIRING "NO ADEQUATE REMEDY BY APPEAL" AND DEMONSTRATION OF "IRREPARABLE INJURY" AND IS COMPELLED TO REITERATE THAT THESE CONSTITUTE THE GROUNDS FOR DENIAL OF THE WRIT, NOT ANY DETERMINATION REGARDING THE LEGAL SOUNDNESS OF THE TRIAL COURT'S ORDER.

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

4	7.	MERCK & COMPANY, INC. V. HON. STEPHEN D. COMBS (JUDGE, PIKE CIRCUIT COURT) AND JAMES RATLIFF MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000529-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	PIKE
4	8.	DONALD E. HOWARD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING IN PART AND REVERSING IN PART, AND REMANDING SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS.	2009-SC-000408-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	CARROLL
4	9.	WILLIAM MUCKER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING, IN PART, AND REVERSING AND REMANDING, IN PART SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH SCHRODER, J., JOINS.	2010-SC-000009-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
5	60.	JOHN MANN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING IN PART AND REVERSING AND REMANDING IN PART ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000047-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	KENTON

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

51.	SHERI LYNN REINSTEDLER V. DANIEL THOMAS REINSTEDLER MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – REVERSING AND REMANDING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000088-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
52.	HOSPITAL OF LOUISA, D/B/A THREE RIVERS MEDICAL CENTER V. JOHNSON COUNTY FISCAL COURT MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - REVERSING AND REMANDING VENTERS, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH MINTON, C.J., AND ABRAMSON, J., JOIN.	2009-SC-000280-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JOHNSON
53.	ERIC BRIAN HARWELL V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – REVERSING AND REMANDING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000333-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
54.	PATRICK SIZEMORE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – REVERSING AND REMANDING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. RENDERED: JANUARY 27, 2011	2009-SC-000645-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LAUREL

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. 2009-SC-000270-KB IN SUPREME PATRICK EDWARD MOEVES TO BE PUBLISHED COURT ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR

1 YEAR WITH CONDITIONS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

WILMA SHELTON V. 2010-SC-000566-DG FAYETTE KENTUCKY EASTER SEALS SOCIETY, INC. ORDER GRANTED DISCRETIONARY

REVIEW, VACATED THE COURT OF APPEALS' OPINION AND REMANDED TO THE COURT OF APPEALS FOR FURTHER PROCEEDINGS.
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ENTERED: MARCH 16, 2011

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY. 2010-SC-000586-OA IN SUPREME BY AND THROUGH JACK CONWAY, TO BE PUBLISHED COURT ATTORNEY GENERAL V. HONORABLE PHILLIP J. SHEPHERD. JUDGE, FRANKLIN CIRCUIT COURT. DIVISION I AND GREGORY WILSON, ET AL. AND KENTUCKY DEPARTMENT OF 2010-SC-000589-OA IN SUPREME TO BE PUBLISHED CORRECTIONS AND COMMONWEALTH COURT OF KENTUCKY, BY AND THROUGH JACK CONWAY, ATTORNEY GENERAL V. HONORABLE PHILLIP J. SHEPHERD, JUDGE FRANKLIN CIRCUIT COURT, **DIVISION I** AND GREGORY WILSON, ET AL. ORDER DENIED PETITIONS FOR WRIT, AND ALL PENDING MOTIONS ARE **DENIED AS MOOT.** CUNNINGHAM AND SCOTT. JJ., DISSENT. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

2010-SC-000684-KB

TO BE PUBLISHED

**IN SUPREME** 

COURT

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V.
MARGARET M. JACKSON-RIGG
ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT
FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR
A PERIOD OF 1 YEAR. SAID
SUSPENSION SHALL BE SERVED
CONSECUTIVELY TO ANY AND ALL
SUSPENSIONS ORDER PRIOR TO
THIS DATE.

SCHRODER, J., DISSENTS. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

#### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V.

CHRISTOPHER S. HARWOOD

ORDER RETROACTIVELY SUSPENDED

RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE

OF LAW FOR A PERIOD OF SIX

MONTHS EFFECTIVE APRIL 7, 2010

TO RUN CONCURRENTLY WITH THE 6

MONTHS PROBATED SENTENCE

ENTERED BY THE OHIO SUPREME COURT.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

SHARON TRAVIS V. 2010-SC-000788-OA IN SUPREME LAURIE K. DUDGEON, DIRECTOR, COURT KENTUCKY ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF THE COURTS; AND KENTUCKY ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF THE COURTS ORDER DISMISSED. MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING. ENTERED: MARCH 23, 2011

J. THOMAS HARDIN V.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

ORDER SUSPENDED MOVANT
FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR
TWO YEARS.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

IN SUPREME
COURT
TO BE PUBLISHED

COURT

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. 2010-SC-000811-KB **IN SUPREME** WILLIAM O. AYERS TO BE PUBLISHED COURT ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR THIRTY DAYS TO BEGIN ON THE DATE OF THE ENTRY OF THIS ORDER

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

OTHER DISCIPLINE.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. 2010-SC-000813-KB IN SUPREME **COURT TIMOTHY CRAWFORD** 

ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR

TO RUN CONSECUTIVELY FROM ANY

THIRTY DAYS.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. 2010-SC-000814-KB IN SUPREME TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

LEO A. MARCUM ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR A PERIOD OF 3 YEARS. SAID SUSPENSION SHALL BE SERVED CONSECUTIVELY TO ANY AND ALL SUSPENSIONS ORDERED PRIOR TO THIS DATE.

SCOTT. J., NOT SITTING. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION, CLE COMMISSION V. GREGORY KEITH SMITH RESPONDENT ORDERED TO PAY \$500.00 TO THE KBA IN LIEU OF SUSPENSION FOR NON COMPLIANCE WITH CLE REQUIREMENTS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2010-SC-000814-KB NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. SHARON EASTHOM ROWSEY ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 181 DAYS WITH CONDITIONS. ABRAMSON, J., NOT SITTING. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2011-SC-000034-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
PETERS FARMS, LLC V. IKERD MINING, LLC, ET AL. ORDER DENIED CR 65.09 RELIEF AND DENIED CR 76.33 RELIEF. VENTERS, J., NOT SITTING. ENTERED: FEBRUARY 16, 2011	2011-SC-000035-I	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. DAVID KAPLAN ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR A PERIOD OF 5 YEARS FROM THE DATE OF THIS ORDER. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2011-SC-000038-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS**

JAMES W. PATTON V.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

ORDER REINSTATED MOVANT

2011-SC-000072-KB

TO BE PUBLISHED

COURT

TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW.
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

VALERIE L. BOCK V. <u>2011-SC-000074-KB</u> IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

ORDER SUSPENDED MOVANT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 181 DAYS

WITH CONDITIONS.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011

## COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW MARCH 16, 2011

TECO MECHANICAL 2009-SC-000821-DG FRANKLIN

CONTRACTOR, INC. V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY,
ENVIRONMENTAL AND PUBLIC
PROTECTION CABINET, ET AL.

KENTUCKY SOUTHERN 2010-SC-000029-DG FRANKLIN

COAL CORPORATION V.
KENTUCKY ENERGY AND
ENVIRONMENT CABINET,
FORMERLY THE ENVIRONMENTAL
AND PUBLIC PROTECTION CABINET

K.R., A/K/A J.W., A CHILD **V.** 2010-SC-000076-DG JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ARNOLD W. CARTER V. 2010-SC-000295-DG BOURBON

JAMIE D. SMITH AND BOURBON COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW MARCH 16, 2011			
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY <b>V.</b> JAMES W. STEADMAN	2010-SC-000326-DG	LOGAN	
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY <b>V.</b> PATRICK O'CONNER	2010-SC-000343-DG	PULASKI	
KENTUCKY UNEMPLOYMENT INSURANCE COMMISSION, ET AL. <b>V.</b> DIANA CECIL	2010-SC-000349-DG	JEFFERSON	
CONNIE HANCOCK, FLOYD COUNTY PROPERTY VALUATION ADMINISTRATOR, ET AL. <b>V.</b> PRESTONSBURG INDUSTRIAL CORPORATION, ET AL.	2010-SC-000376-DG	FLOYD	
HAROLD GENE CUNNINGHAM, ET AL. <b>V.</b> DIANE WHALEN, ET AL.	2010-SC-000564-DG	BOONE	
DESEAN MAYNES <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000681-DG	JEFFERSON	
SAMANTHA DAUGHERTY (NOW BUCHER) <b>V</b> . JOHN STEPHEN TELEK	2011-SC-000043-DE	KENTON	

GENEVA HAGER <b>V.</b> ALLSTATE INSURANCE COMPANY	2009-SC-000741-D	FAYETTE
JULIA CAIN V.  AMERICAN COMMERCE INSURANCE COMPANY INC	2009-SC-000784-D	JEFFERSON

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

LAWYERS MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY OF KENTUCKY V. PAUL STEWART THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000823-D	KNOX
TYLER SIMS, ET AL. <b>V.</b> WILLIAM F. BOSCHEINEN, JR. ET AL.	2010-SC-000007-D	FAYETTE
NORTHERN KENTUCKY WATER DISTRICT V. PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION, CRESTBROOK PROPERTIES, LLC, ET AL.	2010-SC-000017-D	FRANKLIN
ANTHONY O. GRISBY <b>V.</b> UPS GROUND FREIGHT, INC. F/K/A OVERNITE TRANSPORTATION CO., INC., ET AL.	2010-SC-000090-D	FAYETTE
NOTHERN KENTUCKY AREA PLANNING COMMISSION, ET AL. <b>V.</b> RUSSELL CLOYD	2010-SC-000093-D	KENTON
SANDRA C. BROOKS, ET AL. <b>V.</b> LEXINGTON-FAYETTE URBAN COUNTY HOUSING AUTHORITY	2010-SC-000127-D	FAYETTE
ROLAND DOTSON, ET AL. <b>V.</b> GRANGE MUTUAL CASUALTY COMPANY, ET AL.	2010-SC-000273-D	POWELL
GRIFFIN INDUSTRIES, INC. <b>V.</b> CHRISTOPHER PRIESTER	2010-SC-000282-D	LOGAN

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

BARBER CABINET COMPANY, INC. V. PAMELA SPARKS, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000288-D	JESSAMINE
JOHNSON, TRUE & GUARNIERI, LLP V. MICHAEL D. FOLEY, AS MEMBER OF THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR THE ESTATE AND TRUST OF GARVICE D. KINCAID, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000298-D	FAYETTE
WILLIAM CLARK <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000303-D	DAVIESS
TODD REYNOLDS <b>V.</b> SONITROL OF LEXINGTON, INC.	2010-SC-000304-D	FAYETTE
STALLARD B. BOYD <b>V.</b> DIANA LYNN BOYD	2010-SC-000312-D	FLOYD
STANFORD HEALTH & REHABILITATION CENTER, ET AL. V. LUCILLE BROCK, AS ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF GLEN WILLIAMS, DECEASED, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000318-D	LINCOLN
TOMMY KING <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000333-D	ESTILL

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS	<b>DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW</b>
MARCH 16, 2011	

WILLIAM HELTON V. TRI-COUNTY CYCLES BARBOURVILLE, LLC, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000350-D	KNOX
ALLEN HORN, ET AL. <b>V.</b> WILLIAM KENNETH SPURLOCK	2010-SC-000357-D	LAWRENCE
JERRY COCHRAN <b>V.</b> PREMIER CONCRETE PUMPING, INC., A/K/A PREMIER CONCRETE, ET AL.	2010-SC-000359-D	JEFFERSON
ANDREW FORBES, ET AL. V. DIXON ELECTRIC, INC. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000365-D	FAYETTE
ACORDIA OF KENTUCKY, INC. V. WESTERN LEASING, INC. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000380-D	JEFFERSON
JAMES MOORE <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000383-D	JEFFERSON
DANIEL WAXMAN <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY HORSE RACING AUTHORITY	2010-SC-000399-D	FRANKLIN
TUCKER STATION NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION, INC., ET AL. <b>V.</b> LOUISVILLE/JEFFERSON COUNTY METRO GOVERNMENT BOARD OF ZONING ADJUSTMENT, ET AL.	2010-SC-000416-D	JEFFERSON

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

ANGELA CHANEY <b>V.</b> JEFFERY CHANEY	2010-SC-000418-D	PIKE
CITY OF GLASGOW <b>V.</b> JUNE MISSINNE	2010-SC-000436-D	BARREN
KRISTIE STRATTON, ET AL. <b>V.</b> STEVE NEWTON, ET AL.	2010-SC-000451-D	WARREN
RAYFORD POOLE <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000476-D	MCCRACKEN
DOUGLAS MILLER II <b>V.</b> STEVE HANEY, WARDEN, NORTHPOINT TRAINING CENTER	2010-SC-000517-D	BOYLE
RONALD L. MILLS <b>V.</b> RANDY WHITE, WARDEN, GREEN RIVER CORRECTIONAL COMPLEX	2010-SC-000519-D	MUHLENBERG
J. DAVID DONAHUE, WARDEN, KENTUCKY STATE REFORMATORY <b>V.</b> STEVEN JOHNSON, A/K/A "PEE WEE" AND	2010-SC-000523-D	OLDHAM
STEVEN JOHNSON <b>V.</b> J. DAVID DONAHUE, WARDEN, KENTUCKY STATE REFORMATORY	2010-SC-000524-D	OLDHAM
CELINA MUTUAL INSURANCE COMPANY V. HARBOR INSURANCE AGENCY, LLC, D/B/A LAKE BARKLEY INSURANCE AGENCY, AND WILLIAM KEARNEY	2010-SC-000531-D	TRIGG
BILLY JOE WILLIAMS <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000536-D	WHITLEY

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

JAMES L. JENT, ET AL. <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY UTILITIES COMPANY	2010-SC-000557-D	HARDIN
ANTONIO JOHNSON <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000627-D	CHRISTIAN
RONALD LAYTON <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000638-D	JEFFERSON
ELLIS L. KEYES <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000657-D	LAUREL
LESLIE LEON SCOTT <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000662-D	CASEY
ERSKIN THOMAS <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2010-SC-000719-D	FAYETTE
LEXINGTON HOLDINGS ONE, LLC, F/K/A LEXINGTON HOLDINGS, LLC <b>V.</b> PCR CONTRACTORS, INC.	2010-SC-000752-D	FAYETTE
WENDY BOWAN, NOW TIPTON, ET AL. V. ORVILLE BOWMAN THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2010-SC-000779-DE	JEFFERSON
WHITNEY BLAKE SPURGEON <b>V.</b> TAMARA DAWN SPURGEON	2010-SC-000781-DE	PULASKI
ROBYN RANA, F/K/A HAMMOND <b>V.</b> DENNIS E. HAMMOND	2010-SC-000785-DE	GREENUP
PHIL WILLIAMS <b>V.</b> CITIBANK SOUTH DAKOTA N.A.	2010-SC-000796-D	JEFFERSON

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW MARCH 16, 2011

JOHNNELL DENTON V. 2010-SC-000820-DE CAMPBELL

ABBEY MULLIGAN,

DEFACTO CUSTODIAN, ET AL.

C.S., MOTHER V. 2011-SC-000007-DE JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY,

CABINET FOR HEALTH AND

**FAMILY SERVICES** 

## COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW MARCH 18, 2011

TIMOTHY DALE WHALEN, ETC., 2010-SC-000309-D GRANT

ET AL. V.

NORFOLK SOUTHERN CORPORATION

## COURT ORDERS DENYING BELATED MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME TO FILE MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW

KATHY FARWELL, ET AL. V. 2011-SC-000025-D ESTILL

**ESTILL COUNTY BOARD OF** 

EDUCATION, ET AL.

**ENTERED: JANUARY 26, 2011** 

LAURA PHILLIPS V. 2011-SC-000067-D FAYETTE

LEXINGTON FAYETTE URBAN

COUNTY GOVERNMENT ENTERED: MARCH 1, 2011

### COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION TO TRANSFER - MARCH 24, 2011

MICHAEL MITCHELL V. 2010-SC-000762-TG FAYETTE

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING – MARCH 24, 2011**

RONNIE LEE BOWLING <b>V.</b> TOM SIMPSON, WARDEN, KENTUCKY STATE PENITENTIARY	2008-SC-000245-TG	LYON
SHAWN WINDSOR V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED THE OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM RENDERED AUGUST 26, 2010. THE OPINION IS SUBSTITUTED IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL.	2008-SC-000383-MR	JEFFERSON
THOMAS CLYDE BOWLING V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED THE OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE, RENDERED SEPTEMBER 23, 2010. PAGES 1, 7, 11 ARE SUBSTITUTED IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL.	2008-SC-000901-MR	FAYETTE
DEBBIE CHILDERS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED THE OPINION OF OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE ABRAMSON, RENDERED DECEMBER 16, 2010, AND THE OPINION IS SUBSTITUTED THEREFOR.	2009-SC-000297-MR	LAWRENCE
STEVEN KEITH HALLMAN V.	2009-SC-000472-MR	BULLITT

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING – MARCH 24, 2011**

E. DAVID MARSHALL; SUSAN HARDY AND CLAY AVENUE, LLC V. HON. PAMELA R. GOODWINE, JUDGE, FAYETTE CIRCUIT COURT DIVISION FOUR AND DERMOT HALPIN, ET AL.	2009-SC-000495-MR	FAYETTE
JOHN MARRION TERRY <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000497-DG	JEFFERSON
CHRISTOPHER DOUGLAS BANKS <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000631-MR	MONTGOMERY
ALLEN WILEY, III <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000702-MR	JEFFERSON
KARU GENE WHITE V. HON. GARY D. PAYNE (SPECIAL JUDGE) AND COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED THE OPINION OF THE COURT RENDERED AUGUST 26, 2010, BY SUBSTITUTION OF THE OPINION IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL OPINION.	2010-SC-000280-OA	IN SUPREME COURT

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **COURT ORDERS**

GLEN AVERY BRYANT V. PULASKI COUNTY DETENTION CENTER; AND BRIAN BISHOP ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE, RENDERED JANUARY 20, 2011, BY SUBSTITUTION OF PAGES 1 AND 8. ENTERED: FEBRUARY 25, 2011	2009-SC-000036-DG	PULASKI
WILLIAM J. ROGERS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DENIED MOTION TO RECONSIDER. ENTERED: JANUARY 21, 2011	2009-SC-000241-MR	CALDWELL
CONNIE MARSHALL V. JIM HAYNES, ET AL. ORDER DENIED MOVANT'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER. ENTERED: MARCH 4, 2011	2009-SC-000542-D 2009-SC-000652-D	JEFFERSON
LAWRENCE A. LAPOINTE, CO-ADMINISTRATOR OF THE ESTATE OF GLENN A. LAPOINTE, DECEASED, ET AL. V. TODD HAWES ORDER GRANTED PARTIES MOTION TO DISMISS. ENTERED: MARCH 9, 2011	2010-SC-000033-DG	SPENCER
HON. WILLIAM MITCHELL NANCE, CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE, 43 <sup>RD</sup> JUDICIAL CIRCUIT, DIVISION TWO (FAMILY COURT), COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. KENTUCKY ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF THE COURTS ORDER DENIED THE PETITION FILED BY JUDGE WILLIAM NANCE FOR WRIT. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2010-SC-000202-OA	IN SUPREME COURT

## MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **COURT ORDERS**

ENTERED: MARCH 10, 2011

KENTUCKY ASSOCIATED GENERAL CONTRACTORS SELF-INSURANCE FUND V. SHEILA LOWTHER, ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE, ET AL. ORDER DENIED APPELLANT'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER. ENTERED: MARCH 1, 2011.	2010-SC-000114-DG	FRANKLIN
VERNON JOHNSON (AS GUARDIAN OF LUCY ALICE HALE) V. KINDRED NURSING CENTERS LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, ETC., ET AL. ORDER GRANTED MOVANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS THE MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. ENTERED: MARCH 14, 2011	2010-SC-000355-D	CLARK
ROBERT HAMILIN, ET AL. V. DANVILLE-BOYLE COUNTY BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT, ET AL. ORDER GRANTED PARTIES' MOTION TO DISMISS. ENTERED: FEBRUARY 11, 2011	2010-SC-000272-DG	BOYLE
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. RICHARD EUGENE DERRINGER ORDER GRANTED MOTION TO CERTIFY THE LAW. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2010-SC-000685-CL	FAYETTE
DWIGHT INGRAM V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DISMISSED APPEAL.	2010-SC-000690-MR	KENTON

## **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **COURT ORDERS**

BOBBY BROCKMAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DENIED APPELLANT'S MOTION FOR BELATED APPEAL. ENTERED: FEBRUARY 14, 2011	2010-SC-000720-MR	RUSSELL
ROBERT LEON WILLIAMS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DENIED MOVANT'S MOTIONS FOR EXTENSIONS OF TIME TO FILE MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. ENTERED: FEBRUARY 2, 2011	2010-SC-000727-D	HARDIN
INQUIRY COMMISSION V. SCOTT TRUESDELL ORDER PERMANENTLY DISBARRED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2010-SC-000738-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
IN RE: GREGORY T. CANNON ORDER DENYING ENTERED: MARCH 24, 2011	2010-SC-000769-CF	IN SUPREME COURT
TROY KINGREY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER GRANTED APPELLANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS DUPLICATE APPEAL. ENTERED: JANUARY 26, 2011	2010-SC-000773-MR	BARREN
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION, CLE COMMISSION V. DOREEN THOMPSON RESPONDENT ORDERED TO PAY \$100.00 TO THE KBA IN LIEU OF SUSPENSION FOR NON COMPLIANCE WITH CLE REQUIREMENTS. ENTERED: JANUARY 26, 2011	2011-SC-000033-KB	IN SUPREME COURT

#### **MARCH 24, 2011 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **COURT ORDERS**

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION,
CLE COMMISSION V.
THOMAS EDWARD KEATING
RESPONDENT HAS SHOWN CAUSE
WHY HE SHOULD NOT BE SUSPENDED
FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW OR
OTHERWISE SANCTIONED.
ENTERED: FEBRUARY 3, 2011

2011-SC-000053-KB IN SUPREME COURT

## COURT ORDERS PERMITTING MOVANT TO WITHDRAW AS A MEMBER OF THE KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

PAUL A. WILLIS **V.** 2011-SC-000054-KB IN SUPREME KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

**ENTERED: JANUARY 25, 2011** 

ROBERT E. SIMS V. 2011-SC-000055-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

**ENTERED: JANUARY 25, 2011**