MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

25. IRA E. BRANHAM; ET AL. V.
ELIZABETH STEWART
(GUARDIAN OF THE ESTATE
OF THE PERSON OF GARY
RYAN STEWART, AN
INCOMPETENT PERSON)
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON –
AFFIRMING

SCOTT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS.

26. DANNY MONTGOMERY V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE ABRAMSON –
AFFIRMING
NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT
ONLY.

2007-SC-000250-DG

PIKE

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Professional Negligence. Attorney and Client. Infants. Guardian and Ward. Issues include whether malpractice suit may be brought by former infant and ward against attorney who represented former next friend and guardian.

2007-SC-000852-MR

TRIMBLE

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

First Degree Sexual Abuse and First Degree Persistent Felony Offender-20 years. Evidence of defendant's similar abuse of three other young girls was properly admissible as to the sexual abuse charge under the modus operandi exception to KRE 404(b). Although the trial court may have abused its discretion by joining the rape and abuse offenses where joinder entailed the introduction of collateral acts of sexual abuse at defendant's rape trial, the misjoinder, if any, was not prejudicial. Trial court properly excluded evidence of minor victim's collateral sexual conduct and evidence that abuse allegations had been made against minor victim.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 27. PETITIONER F; ET AL. V. BRIDGET SKAGGS BROWN. COMMISSIONER, DEPARTMENT OF JUVENILE JUSTICE, IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY. **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE SCHRODER -**AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 28. **COMMONWEALTH OF** KENTUCKY, CABINET FOR **HEALTH AND FAMILY** SERVICES V. HONORABLE GREGORY M. BARTLETT, JUDGE, KENTON CIRCUIT COURT AND LARRY COLE: ET AL. **OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE -AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 29. BRANDON LEON WATKINS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM -**AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2008-SC-000213-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

FRANKLIN

Questions Presented:

DNA sampling statutes are applicable to juvenile public offenders.

2008-SC-000508-MR

KENTON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

In a criminal case, the defendant's unquestionable constitutional right to exculpatory evidence in the government's possession gives a trial court the power to order an in camera review of KASPER reports.

2008-SC-000567-DG

TODD

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Standing . Search and Seizure. Abandonment. Issues include whether a suspect's immediate flight from a vehicle after being pulled over constitutes abandonment and thereby deprives the suspect of standing to contest the subsequent search of the vehicle.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

30. MARK PADGETT V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE NOBLE –
AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2008-SC-000632-MR CAMPBELL TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Affirmance of convictions of Criminal Attempt to commit First Degree manslaughter; Second Degree Assault and Violation of an Emergency Protective Order.

31. ALAN HUMMEL V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE NOBLE –
AFFIRMING
SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT
ONLY.

2008-SC-000801-MR

KENTON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

First Degree Rape; Third Degree Rape and Second Degree Persistent Felony Offender. A request for self-representation may be denied upon a determination that the defendant is unable or unwilling to abide by courtroom protocol during the defense, or that the request is made purely as a tactic to disrupt or delay the proceedings. A trial court's determination will be reviewed for an abuse of discretion.

32. ROBERT CARL FOLEY V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2009-SC-000428-TG
TO BE PUBLISHED

FRANKLIN

Affirmance of denial of Petition for Declaratory Judgment. KRS 503.055-the "Castle Doctrine" statute. Self-defense statutes in effect at the time of Foley's trial are constitutional.

Questions Presented:

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 33. SPRINT COMMUNICATIONS
 COMPANY, L.P. V.
 ALBERT E. LEGGETT, III (AS
 TRUSTEE OF THE ALBERT E.
 LEGGETT FAMILY TRUST)
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY
 JUSTICE VENTERS –
 AFFIRMING IN PART AND
 REVERSING IN PART
 MINTON, C.J. AND ABRAMSON,
 J., NOT SITTING.
- 34. KELLY MARQUETTE STEWART V.
 COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY
 JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM –
 AFFIRMING IN PART AND
 VACATING IN PART
 SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN PART
 AND DISSENTS IN PART BY
 SEPARATE OPINION.

2005-SC-001023-DG 2007-SC-000273-DG **JEFFERSON**

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Abuse of Process. Eminent Domain.

Discovery. Issues include whether telephone company's attempted use of eminent domain statute to acquire building constitutes abuse of process.

2007-SC-000278-MR 2007-SC-000853-MR TO BE PUBLISHED **FAYETTE**

Questions Presented:

First Degree Possession of a Controlled Substance; First Degree Promoting Contraband; Possession of Drug Paraphernalia (second or subsequent offense): Possession of Marijuana; Giving a Police officer a False Name; Representing as one's own another's license; Improper signal; Failure to illuminate a license plate; and First Degree Persistent Felony Offender. Erroneous jury instruction during the penalty phase, which omitted an element of the prior misdemeanor conviction, was palpable error.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

35. DAVID THOMAS COHRON V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON –
AFFIRMING, IN PART, AND
REVERSING AND REMANDING,
IN PART

SCOTT, J., CONCURS, IN PART, AND DISSENTS, IN PART, BY SEPARATE OPINION.

2007-SC-000483-MR TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON**

Questions Presented:

First Degree Fleeing and Evading; First Degree Wanton Endangerment; Receiving Stolen Property over \$300; two counts of Second Degree Escape; Fourth Degree Assault; Reckless Driving; and First Degree Persistent Felony Offender-40 years. Reversal of one of the two Second Degree Escape convictions.

36. CASSANDRA SMITH V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING IN PART AND
REVERSING AND REMANDING
IN PART
CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.

2008-SC-000060-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON**

PUBLISHED

Criminal Law. Search and Seizure.
Miranda Warnings. Custody Determination.
Issues include the admissibility of
incriminating statements where the
defendant was handcuffed but not
Mirandized, and specifically whether the
holding in Taylor v. Commonwealth, 182
S.W.3d 521 (Ky. 2006) that handcuffing a
suspect does not necessarily constitute
"custody" for Miranda purposes should be
re-evaluated. Also at issue is the breadth
of the safety exception which prevents
questions from being deemed
"interrogation."

Questions Presented:

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

37. ESSAMOND WILBURN V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
AFFIRMING IN PART AND
REVERSING AND REMANDING
IN PART

SCHRODER, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY BY SEPARATE OPINION, IN WHICH SCOTT, J., JOINS. NOBLE, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH MINTON, C.J., JOINS.

38. FREDERICK RENNEL HANNAH V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE SCOTT –
REVERSING

MINTON, C.J., AND ABRAMSON, J., CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY. SCOTT, J., CONCURS BY SEPARATE OPINION.

39. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V.
LAWRENCE EVERETT ALLEMAN
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
REVERSING
SCHRODER, J., DISSENTS BY
SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH
MINTON, C.J., JOINS.

2008-SC-000787-MR

JEFFERSON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

First Degree Burglary; First Degree Robbery and Second Degree Persistent Felony Offender. Defendant was entitled to a directed verdict on the burglary charge. No Batson violation.

2007-SC-000267-MR

MCCRACKEN

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Murder-Life Imprisonment. No "duty to retreat". Trial court erred in not allowing the jury to be questioned during voir dire about any prejudice they might have regarding the "duty to retreat" and in prohibiting the defendant from arguing in closing argument that he had "no duty to retreat."

2007-SC-000570-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **HARDIN**

Questions Presented:

Trial court's findings of fact and reasons for probation revocation entered orally on the record from the bench are sufficient to satisfy due process.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

40. THOMAS WEIRD V. **ERIC EMBERTON OPINION OF THE COURT-REVERSING** ABRAMSON, J., NOT SITTING.

- 41. CINCINNATI INSURANCE COMPANY V. MOTORISTS MUTUAL INSURANCE **COMPANY OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON -**REVERSING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 42. FLUKE CORPORATION V. GARY LEMASTER, ET AL. **OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON -**REVERSING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2008-SC-000372-DG

JEFFERSON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Appellate Procedure. Filing of Appeal. At issue is whether an otherwise one-day late notice of appeal was rendered timely by the early closure of the Jefferson County Circuit Clerk's Office for the Derby parade on the due date.

2008-SC-000293-DG

JEFFERSON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Insurance. Property damage. Contractors. At issue is whether contractual recovery may be premised upon a builder's substandard work.

2008-SC-000530-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

PERRY

Questions Presented:

Statute of Limitations. Equitable Tolling. Issues include whether failure to report product safety concerns to federal regulatory agency estops defendant from invoking statute of limitations defense to a claim for injuries caused by the product.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 43. CENTRAL KENTUCKY
 NEWS-JOURNAL V.
 HON. DOUGHLAS M. GEORGE
 (JUDGE, TAYLOR CIRCUIT
 COURT), ET AL.
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY
 JUSTICE SCOTT—
 REVERSING
 CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS
 BY SEPARATE OPINION IN
 WHICH SCOTT, J., JOINS.
- 44. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, EX REL. J. MICHAEL BROWN, SECRETARY, JUSTICE AND PUBLIC SAFETY CABINET V.
 INTERACTIVE MEDIA ENTERTAINMENT AND GAMING ASSOCIATION, INC.; ET AL.
 OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE –
 REVERSING
 SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.
- 45. DARRELL H. MOORE, ET AL. V, ROY E. STILLS, ET AL.

 OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE ABRAMSON –

 REVERSING

 SCOTT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH VENTERS, J., JOINS.

2009-SC-000018-MR TAYLOR TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Settlement agreements involving the expenditure of public funds were subject to disclosure under the Open Records Act. Agreements were not exempt from disclosure under the Act's personal privacy exception, KRS 61.878(1)a.

2009-SC-000043-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

FRANKLIN

OBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Internet domain names and associations of anonymous domain registrants do not have standing to defend against forfeiture actions.

2008-SC-000193-DG

HOPKINS

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Petitioner's recreational use was not enough to establish adverse possession of another's land under common law or KRS 411.190(8). Petitioner failed to prove the "well-defined boundary" element of their claim.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

- 46. FRED LEE COLVARD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE VENTERS -**REVERSING AND REMANDING** MINTON, C.J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART AND WOULD NOT ALLOW INTRODUCTION OF 1994 ATTEMPTED RAPE CONVICTION BECAUSE THE FACTS OF THE **CURRENT CASE ARE NOT** SUFFICIENTLY SIMILAR TO SATISFY KRE 404(B). HE CONCURS IN ALL OTHER RESPECTS. SCOTT, J., **CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS** IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH ABRAMSON, J., JOINS.
- 47. TERRY GLENN HOBSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE VENTERS -**REVERSING AND REMANDING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.
- 48. ROBERT EUGENE DENNIS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE ABRAMSON -**VACATING AND REMANDING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2007-SC-000477-MR

JEFFERSON

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

First Degree Sodomy; two counts of First Degree Rape: First Degree Burglary and Second Degree Persistent Felony Offender-Life Imprisonment. Testimony from medical personnel was improperly admitted through the hearsay exception under KRE 803(4). Court's previous interpretation of the hearsay exception for "statements for purposes of medical treatment or diagnosis" was too broad; testimony herein was inappropriate.

2007-SC-000645-DG

BOYD

TO BE PUBLISHED

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Robbery. Issues include whether escape stage occurs "in the course of committing theft" under KRS 515 .020.

2008-SC-000049-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

DAVIESS

Questions Presented:

Three counts of First Degree Sodomy and First Degree Sexual Abuse-65 years. Trial court erred in failing to obtain and review potentially material CHFS records.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

49.	WOODIE CANTRELL, ET AL. V. ASHLAND OIL, INC., ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY BY SEPARATE OPINION. SCHRODER AND SCOTT, JJ., NOT SITTING.	2006-SC-000763-DG 2007-SC-000818-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JOHNSON
50.	ROBERT SOLINGER, M.D.; ET AL. V. MELANIE PEARSON, ET AL. AND	2007-SC-000389-DG 2008-SC-000133-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
	NORTON HOSPITAL, INC. V. MELANIE PEARSON MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT — AFFIRMING SCOTT AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY. CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS BY SEPARATE OPINION. NOBLE, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION.	2007-SC-000414-DG 2008-SC-000134-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
51.	BRYAN RICHARD HAMM V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING NOBLE, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH MINTON, C.J., JOINS.	2007-SC-000616-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FAYETTE

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

52	MICHAEL THURMAN BALL V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING SCHRODER, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH NOBLE, J., JOINS. NOBLE, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH SCHRODER, J., JOINS. CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.	2008-SC-000430-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	BATH
53	S. VERONA BRINEGAR V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000491-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	MADISON
54	CAREY MCNEIL V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000647-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
55	ROBERT CARL FOLEY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000909-TG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LAUREL
56	BILLY MASH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000951-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	MCCRACKEN

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

57.	STEVEN BRYANT V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000054-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
58.	VIRGIL LEE KELLY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000090-TG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	CLARK
59.	JAMES E. TIPTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000119-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	MEADE
60.	TERRY GIBSON V. KUHN GIBSON & SON PLUMBING; ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000412-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS
61.	ANTHONY L. RODEBACK V. HON. CHARLES R. HICKMAN, JUDGE, SHELBY CIRCUIT COURT, ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT — AFFIRMING MINTON, C.J.; AND ABRAMSON, J., CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY.	2009-SC-000636-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	SHELBY

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

62. CHRISTOPHER STEWARD V. 2008-SC-000617-MR KENTON COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY NOT TO BE PUBLISHED **MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE** COURT -AFFIRMING IN PART, REVERSING **IN PART** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. 63. RAYMOND KEETON V. 2008-SC-000659-MR **HOPKINS** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED** MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT -**AFFIRMING IN PART AND REVERSING IN PART** SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS.

64. WILLIE L. LITTLE V.

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE

COURT –

AFFIRMING IN PART AND REVERSING

IN PART

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

KENTON

65. TIMOTHY SMITH V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE
COURT AFFIRMING IN PART AND VACATING
IN PART
MINTON, C.J.; AND ABRAMSON, J.,
CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY. NOBLE,

CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY. NOBLE, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION, IN WHICH SCHRODER, J., JOINS. SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

66. GLENN ODOM V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE
COURT –
AFFIRMING IN PART, REVERSING
IN PART, AND REMANDING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2008-SC-000272-MR JEFFERSON NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

67. JUAN R. PELEGRIN-VIDAL V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE
COURT –
REVERSING

NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT
BE SEPARATE OPINION.
ABRAMSON, J., CONCURS IN
PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY
SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH
MINTON, C.J., AND CUNNINGHAM,
J., JOIN. CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS
IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY
SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH
MINTON, C.J., AND ABRAMSON, J.,
JOIN.

2007-SC-000848-MR JEFFERSON NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

68. RONALD CRABTREE V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE
COURT –
REVERSING

NOBLE, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. SCOTT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH CUNNINGHAM, J., JOINS. 2008-SC-000551-MR MADISON NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

69.	DESMOND J. SNORTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - REVERSING ABRAMSON, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. CUNNINGHAM, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION.	2008-SC-000612-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	CALDWELL
70.	KENNETH PATTERSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - REVERSING AND REMANDING CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.	2008-SC-000236-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FULTON
71.	JAMES STUMP V. RIVERTOWN STEEL; ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – VACATING AND DISMISSING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000531-WC NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FROM COURT OF APPEALS

OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MARCH 10, 2010

JERMAINE CHATMAN V. 2009-SC-000465-DG SIMPSON COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
ORDER GRANTED DISCRETIONARY REVIEW,
VACATED THE COURT OF APPEALS OPINION
AND REMANDED TO THE COURT OF APPEALS
FOR FURTHER PROCEEDINGS.
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

OPINIONS AND ORDERS – MARCH 18, 2010

BRADLEY F. WALLACE V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER DENIED MOVANT REINSTATEMENT TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000636-KB NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENNETH W. LAMPE V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER REINSTATED MOVANT TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2008-SC-000850-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
THELMA SPENCER COMBS; ET AL. V. HONORABLE FRANK ALLEN FLETCHER (JUDGE, BREATHITT CIRCUIT COURT), ET AL. ORDER AFFIRMED. NOBLE, J., NOT SITTING.	2009-SC-000258-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	BREATHITT
DAVID MOORE COORSSEN V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER REINSTATED MOVANT TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW WITH CONDITIONS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000307-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
THELMA SPENCER COMBS; ET AL. V. KENTUCKY COURT OF APPEALS AND SUPREME COURT OF KENTUCKY ORDER DISMISSED. NOBLE, J., NOT SITTING.	2009-SC-000486-OA TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KEVIN DWAYNE SAMPLES V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER RESTORED MOVANT TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000537-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MARCH 18, 2010

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. DOUGLAS C. COMBS, JR. ORDER PERMANENTLY DISBARRED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000688-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. LUANN C. GLIDEWELL ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR THREE YEARS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000695-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ANGELA RENEE KINSER V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER RESTORED MOVANT TO THE PRACTICE OF LAW. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000720-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
THE COURIER-JOURNAL, INC.; ET AL. V. LEONARD LAWSON; ET AL. ORDER AFFIRMED. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2009-SC-000756-I TO BE PUBLISHED	FRANKLIN
IN RE: HEATHER ELIZABETH ROCHET ORDER DENIED MOTION TO RECONSIDER ORDER OF SUSPENSION. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000013-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. RONALD DEAN HARRIS ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR SIXTY-ONE (61) DAYS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2010-SC-000016-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MARCH 18, 2010

PAUL GREGORY CROUSHORE V.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION

ORDER RETROACTIVELY SUSPENDED

MOVANT FROM THE PRACTICE OF

LAW FOR 1 YEAR.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

IN SUPREME
COURT

GEORGE LAPRADD, JR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000214-DG	JEFFERSON
REUBIN BAILEY V. PRESERVE RURAL ROADS OF MADISON COUNTY, INC. AND CURTIS TATE	2009-SC-000417-DG	MADISON
PROGRESSIVE MAX INSURANCE COMPANY V. NATIONAL CAR RENTAL SYSTEMS, INC.	2009-SC-000577-DG	JEFFERSON
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. MARK JOHNSON	2009-SC-000589-DG	GRAVES
CAROLYN RICE V. JACKIE RICE	2009-SC-000730-DG	GREENUP
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. JAMES ADKINS	2009-SC-000782-DG	OHIO
INDUSTRIAL RISK INSURERS, AN UNINCORPORATED ASSOCIATION, ET AL. V. GIDDINGS & LEWIS, INC., A WISCONSIN CORPORATION, ET AL.	2009-SC-000825-DG	GRAVES

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

2009-SC-000839-D

<u>COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – MARCH 10, 2010</u>

MICHAEL G. BEGLIN, EXECUTOR OF THE ESTATE OF JENNIFER W. BEGLIN, ET AL. V. UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER, INC., D/B/A UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE HOSPITAL JEFFERSON

BUTLER & ASSOCIATES, P.S.C. V. DAVID R. HARROD, ET AL.	2009-SC-000194-D	FRANKLIN
KENNETH E. ASHER V. BARBARA ASHER	2009-SC-000201-D	JEFFERSON
CHARLES ADAMS V . LOUISVILLE-JEFFERSON COUNTY METRO GOVERNMENT	2009-SC-000202-D	JEFFERSON
ST. MATTHEWS FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT V. JOHN E. AUBREY, JEFFERSON COUNTY SHERIFF; ET AL.	2009-SC-000236-D	JEFFERSON
JOSHUA CROMER V. LEXINGTON-FAYETTE URBAN COUNTY GOVERNMENT	2009-SC-000247-D	FAYETTE
K.F., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000316-D	KENTON
BOBBY DAVID BROCKMAN V . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000331-D	RUSSELL
TOMMY G. LAMBERT V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000355-D	KNOX

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

CONCEPT HOMES, LLC; DENNIS ZAHLER; SCOTT ZAHLER; AND ERIC DETERS V. VICTORIA HUEBENER; AND JERRY HUEBENER	2009-SC-000365-D	CAMPBELL
JEFFREY MCDONALD; DONNA WALDRUM; DONALD MOORE; AND GERALD BROWNLEE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION CABINET, ET AL.	2009-SC-000399-D	FRANKLIN
CHARLES W. STRATTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000426-D	CAMPBELL
DARLENE HARRIS V. CAMP TAYLOR FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT	2009-SC-000427-D	JEFFERSON
GEORGE A. GABBARD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000453-D	BELL
MICHAEL MCINTOSH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000455-D	CAMPBELL
LEXICON, INC., D/B/A SCHUECK STEEL V. ICON CONSTRUCTION, INC., ET AL.	2009-SC-000459-D	CARROLL
TERRY LAWRENCE MANN V . KENTUCKY EDUCATION PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS BOARD	2009-SC-000464-D	FRANKLIN
ISMAEL ROQUE GUTIERREZ V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000469-D	TRIMBLE

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

CLEVELAND DEVONE FINCH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000473-D	JEFFERSON
THOMAS M. BOYD V. JOHN B. BOYD	2009-SC-000491-D	TRIGG
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, COMMERCE CABINET (NOW TOURISM, ARTS AND HERITAGE CABINET), DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND WILDLIFE RESOURCES V. JULIE BADGETT	2009-SC-000499-D	FRANKLIN
FAYETTE COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION V . CAROL LYNNE MANER, ET AL.	2009-SC-000505-D	FAYETTE
MICHAEL TAYLOR V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000507-D	HARDIN
D.B., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000510-D	SIMPSON
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V . CASSANDRA TAYLOR	2009-SC-000517-D	OWEN
LEXCIN PARTNERS, LTD V. NEWMARK SOUTHERN REGION, LLC	2009-SC-000540-D	FAYETTE
ADRIAN BROWN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000553-D	HARDIN

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

KENNETH L. RAMSEY; AND RAMSEY FARM V. DAVID LAMBERT; AND EQUINE ANALYSIS SYSTEMS, INC. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000554-D	FAYETTE
LAMONT ROBERTS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000558-D	JEFFERSON
JEANNE WELSH V. PHOENIX TRANSPORTATION SERVICES; AND KEVIN B. WARREN THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000571-D	SCOTT
TEKO HATFIELD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000591-D	JEFFERSON
JEFFERY L. CARPENTER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000594-D	BUTLER
THEODORE BRADFORD, ET AL. V. CITY OF CRESTVIEW HILLS, ET AL. AND	2009-SC-000597-D	KENTON
THEODORE BRADFORD, INDIVIDUALLY, ET AL. V. PEOPLES COMMUNITY BANK, ET AL.	2009-SC-000599-D	KENTON
DAVID BAILEY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000616-D	HARRISON

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES V. GAMBREL'S FOOD MART, INC. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000617-D	FRANKLIN
INGRID WOODS V. WESTERN KENTUCKY UNIVERSITY	2009-SC-000622-D	WARREN
MILDRED PATTON V . KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS	2009-SC-000646-D	FRANKLIN
KURT ROBERT SMITH V . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000649-D	FAYETTE
ADRIAN LONDON V . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000667-D	MCCRACKEN
DAVID LEE LEWIS, JR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000669-D	BELL
MARCUS BUFORD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000690-D	MCCRACKEN
JOHN & CHRIS CONSTRUCTION, LLC V. MEADOW PEAK HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION, INC.	2009-SC-000697-D	BULLITT
LOUISVILLE GALLERIA, LLC; AND MANUFACTURERS AND TRADERS TRUST COMPANY V. SCARBOROUGH MECHANICAL SERVICE, INC.	2009-SC-000735-D	JEFFERSON

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW -
MARCH 10, 2010

SCARBOROUGH MECHANICAL SERVICES, INC. V. LOUISVILLE GALLERIA, INC.; AND MANUFACTURERS AND TRADERS TRUST COMPANY	2009-SC-000739-D	JEFFERSON
RANDALL E. KING V. KAREN LYNN KING	2009-SC-000761-D	DAVIESS
J. S., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2009-SC-000781-DE	FAYETTE
HOLLY CREEK PRODUCTION CORPORATION V. DOWIE BANKS; AND MARTHA BANKS THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2009-SC-000799-D	WOLFE
THE LANCASTER AGENCY, INC.; AND CHARLES E. LANCASTER, JR. V. CHARLES GARRETT; AND GINA GARRETT	2009-SC-000802-D	MARION
SCOTTFORD LEE BRYANT V.	2010-SC-000008-D	BARREN

COURT ORDERS DENYING BELATED MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME TO FILE MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ERIC WAYNE RAGSDALE V. 2009-SC-000707-MR **JEFFERSON** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **JANUARY 29, 2010**

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

<u>COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION TO TRANSFER – MARCH 18, 2010</u>

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES, ET AL. **V.** BLUEGRASS ORTHOPAEDICS SURGICAL DIVISION, LLC. 2009-SC-000691-T

FRANKLIN

COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING – MARCH 18, 2010

STEPHEN R. CHAPPELL, 2006-SC-000140-DG **FAYETTE** INDIVIDUALLY AND AS PARTNERS AND/OR EMPLOYEES OF LANDRUM & SHOUSE, A KENTUCKY GENERAL PARTNERSHIP, ET AL. V. KUHLMAN ELECTRIC CORPORATION AND KUHLMAN ELECTRIC CORPORATION V. 2006-SC-000144-DG **FAYETTE** STEPHEN R. CHAPPELL, INDIVIDUALLY AND AS PARTNERS AND/OR EMPLOYEES OF LANDRUM & SHOUSE, A KENTUCKY GENERAL PARTNERSHIP, ET AL. JAMES HUNT V. 2006-SC-000634-MR FLOYD COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE VENTERS **RENDERED NOVEMBER 25, 2009,** AND SUBSTITUTED IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL OPINION. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. 2007-SC-000127-DG **BULLITT KEVIN T. MCCOMBS** ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM. **RENDERED MARCH 19, 2009, AND** SUBSTITUTED IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL OPINION.

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

THE KROGER COMPANY, 2008-SC-000415-DG WARREN D/B/A COUNTRY OVEN BAKERY V. JOANNE BUCKLEY QUINCY OMAR CROSS V. 2008-SC-000465-MR **HICKMAN** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE **COURT RENDERED NOVEMBER 25.** 2009, AND SUBSTITUTED IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL OPINION. **TAYLOR** JOHN A. HUMPHRESS, JR. V. 2009-SC-000138-MR HON. DOUGHLAS M. GEORGE, JUDGE, TAYLOR CIRCUIT COURT AND PATRICIA ANN HUMPHRESS; ET AL. **COURT ORDERS DISMISSING** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, 2008-SC-000552-MR WOODFORD CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES V. HON, ROBERT JOHNSON, JUDGE, WOODFORD CIRCUIT COURT JASON LEE TODD, REAL PARTY IN INTEREST **ENTERED: MARCH 18, 2010**

ANGIE TERREESE RICKETS V. 2009-SC-000723-D HARDIN

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ENTERED: MARCH 10, 2010

FORD MOTOR COMPANY V. 2009-SC-000753-MR JEFFERSON

HON. CONLIFFE F. KENNETH, JUDGE, JEFFERSON CIRCUIT

COURT, ET AL.

ENTERED: JANUARY 26, 2010

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

WAL-MART STORES, INC. V. 2007-SC-000841-MR BOYD

HON. MARC I. ROSEN, JUDGE, BOYD CIRCUIT COURT, ET AL. ENTERED: JANUARY 27, 2010

COURT ORDERS

ASSOCIATED INSURANCE SERVICE, 2008-SC-000037-DG JEFFERSON

INC. ET AL. V.

DANIEL GARCIA, M.D. ET AL.

ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM RENDERED JANUARY 21, 2010, BY MODIFICATION ON LINE 4 OF PAGE 7.

ENTERED: FEBRUARY 3, 2010

MELISSA HELTON V. 2008-SC-000141-MR JESSAMINE

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE
COURT BY JUSTICE NOBLE RENDERED
AUGUST 27, 2009, BY SUBSTITUTING

PAGES 1 AND 13.

ENTERED: JANUARY 26, 2010

RALPH BAZE V. 2009-SC-000188-MR FRANKLIN

LADONNA THOMPSON, COMMISSIONER, DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS

ORDER DENIED MOTION TO STAY THE ENFORCEMENT OF OPINION RENDERED

JANUARY 21, 2010.

ENTERED: FEBRUARY 24, 2010

KURT J. LOWE V. 2009-SC-000478-OA IN SUPREME

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY COURT

ORDER DENIED MOTION TO OBJECT, RECONSIDER AND CORRECT ERROR.

ENTERED: JANUARY 21, 2010

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. ERIC LAMAR EMERSON ORDER MODIFIED OPINION OF THE COURT BY MODIFICATION ON PAGE 4, LINE 4 TO CORRECT SUPREME COURT RULE NUMBER. ENTERED: MARCH 5, 2010	2009-SC-000508-KB	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION CLE COMMISSION V. JEROME REID BAKER, JR. RESPONDENT ORDERED TO PAY \$75.00 TO THE KBA IN LIEU OF SUSPENSION FOR NON COMPLIANCE OF CLE REQUIREMENTS. ENTERED: MARCH 18, 2010	2009-SC-000835-KB	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION, CLE COMMISSION V. JASON PATRICK FERRANTE RESPONDENT ORDERED TO PAY \$200.00 TO THE KBA IN LIEU OF SUSPENSION FOR NON COMPLIANCE OF CLE REQUIREMENTS. ENTERED: JANUARY 12, 2010	2009-SC-000837-KB	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION, CLE COMMISSION V. D. ANTHONY BRINKER RESPONDENT ORDERED TO PAY \$750.00 TO THE KBA IN LIEU OF SUSPENSION FOR NON COMPLIANCE OF CLE REQUIREMENTS. ENTERED: MARCH 18, 2010	2010-SC-000004-KB	IN SUPREME COURT

MINUTES MARCH 18, 2010

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

COURT ORDERS

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION, 2010-SC-000005-KB IN SUPREME

CLE COMMISSION V. COURT

BRIAN LARS HAYNES

ORDER GRANTED EXTENSION OF TIME TO COMPLETE CLE

REQUIREMENTS.

ENTERED: MARCH 18, 2010

JAMES MICHAEL WHITE V. 2010-SC-000026-D CHRISTIAN

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY COURT

ORDER DENIED MOTION TO PROCEED

IN FORMA PAUPERIS.

ENTERED: JANUARY 29, 2010

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. <u>2010-SC-000064-KB</u> IN SUPREME

WILLIAM O. AYERS TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

ORDER CONFIRMED AUTOMATIC

SUSPENSION.

ENTERED: MARCH 18, 2010

COURT ORDERS PERMITTING MOVANT TO WITHDRAW AS A MEMBER OF THE KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION LAW - MARCH 9, 2010

DARRYL M. KATES V. 2010-SC-000165-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT