#### SUPREME COURT OF KENTUCKY

#### **FEBRUARY 18, 2021 RULINGS**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

15. ABBOTT, INC. V. SAMUEL GUIRGUIS, ET AL.

# OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE VANMETER - <u>VACATING</u> AND REMANDING

MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. CONLEY, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. LAMBERT, J., NOT SITTING.

16. BRENT FOREMAN, ET AL. V. AUTO CLUB PROPERTY-CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. LAMBERT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY. KELLER, J., CONCURS BY SEPARATE OPINION, IN WHICH CONLEY AND NICKELL, JJ., JOIN.

2018-SC-0577-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **HOPKINS** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Real Property. Champerty. Judicial Recusal. Issues involve a circuit court judge's refusal to recuse from consideration of a dispute regarding ownership of an elevated strip of land last used as a railway line in 2001, near which the judge prior to this litigation (and before he was a judge) was involved in an alleged trespass for purposes of hunting on land owned by one of the parties.

2018-SC-0618-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON** 

#### **Ouestions Presented:**

Insurance. Intentional-Loss Exclusion. Mental Incapacity. Opinion of the Court holding that the trial court erred by granting summary judgment in favor of appellants in declaratory action concerning coverage for property damage caused by a suicide attempt of an insured. Court held intentional-loss exclusion of insurance policy must be read from an objective viewpoint, but held an intentional-loss exclusion in a policy may be overcome if it can be proven that the insured that caused the loss was suffering from a lack of mental capacity at the time of the act under the standard set forth in *Stone v. Kentucky Farm Bureau Mutual Ins. Co.*, 34 S.W.3d 809 (Ky. App. 2000).

17. MICHAEL LEE BARNETT V. CENTRAL KENTUCKY HAULING, LLC

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON - AFFIRMING

MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. LAMBERT, J., NOT SITTING.

18. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. SAMUEL DAUGHTERY

## OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON - REVERSING AND REMANDING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

### 2019-SC-0064-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

### **FAYETTE**

### **Questions Presented:**

Employment Law. Kentucky Civil Rights Act. Opinion of the Court affirming the trial court's dismissal of a complaint alleging wrongful termination of employment under the KCRA on grounds of associational disability, finding the plain language of the KCRA does not create a cause of action for associational discrimination – an employee's association with someone with a disability, such as a spouse.

### 2019-SC-0201-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

**JEFFERSON** 

### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. KRS 17.500 and KRS 17.520. Sex Offender Registration Act (SORA). Commonwealth sought discretionary review from a Court of Appeals' decision that defendant was excepted from lifetime SORA registration due to a new single-course-of-conduct exception it created. Defendant pleaded guilty to three felony counts of distributing child pornography in violation of KRS 531.340. Violations of KRS 531.340 are crimes against a minor; KRS 17.520(2)(a) states that a conviction of two or more felony offenses against a minor warrant a lifetime SORA registration. Defendant's acts were three separate convictions per Welborn v. Commonwealth, 157 S.W.3d 608 (Ky. 2005). As such, defendant should have a lifetime SORA registration.

19. DAVID WAYNE DOOLEY **V.**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0262-MR TO BE PUBLISHED **BOONE** 

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON - <u>AFFIRMING</u>

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. KRE 404(b). Admission of Tangible Evidence. KRE 615. Missing-Evidence Instruction. Issues addressed include proof of commission of another crime as evidence of motive and identity under KRE 404(b), sufficiency of foundational evidence required for admission of tangible evidence connected to murder, effect of witness's pre-testimony interaction with a law enforcement official under KRE 615, and rejection of missing evidence instruction in circumstances demonstrating loss of evidence due to mistake, rather than bad faith, by the Commonwealth.

20. CHRISTOPHER ALEXANDER POPE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE HUGHES - <u>AFFIRMING</u>

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2019-SC-0522-MR TO BE PUBLISHED LINCOLN

### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Jurisdiction of Law Enforcement Agency. KRS 431.007. KRS 218A.240. Opinion of the Court affirming appellant's convictions for multiple drug-related offenses. Court held local law enforcement agency did not lack jurisdiction to investigate in a neighboring county under KRS 431.007(1) because the statute only applies to powers of arrest of an out-of-county officer. Court held controlling statute concerning jurisdiction to conduct out-of-county investigations regarding controlled substances is controlled by KRS 218A.240(1), and further a motion to suppress is not the proper procedural vehicle to challenge a statutory violation where there is no violation of constitutional rights.

21. JOSHUA A. TOWE **V.**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

22. CHARLES MARTIN V. WARRIOR COAL LLC, ET AL.

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE HUGHES - <u>AFFIRMING</u>

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. LAMBERT, J., DISSENTS WITHOUT SEPARATE OPINION.

### 2019-SC-0694-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

LAUREL

### **Questions Presented:**

Criminal Law. Jury Instructions. Sexual Abuse. Sodomy. Opinion of the Court affirming appellant's conviction and sentence for multiple counts of sexual abuse and sodomy. Court held the jury instructions given at appellant's trial did not create a "multiple-acts error" in violation of Double Jeopardy Clause because the instructions given for sexual abuse and sodomy sufficiently differentiated the anatomical distinctions in the conduct required for a finding of guilt for each offense. Court rejected appellant's sufficiency of the evidence argument regarding the trial court's denial of a directed verdict and found a single statement made by the prosecutor, which bolstered the witness's truthfulness, to be harmless error.

2020-SC-0055-WC TO BE PUBLISHED COURT OF APPEALS

### **Questions Presented:**

Workers' Compensation. KRS 342.040. Interest. Income Benefits. Opinion of the Court affirming Court of Appeals. Court held that absent the "without reasonable foundation" exception in KRS 342.040, the legislative intent of the 2017 statutory amendment of KRS 342.040, as discerned from the General Assembly's non-codified but express language regarding its intent, was to make all income benefit awards entered after June 29, 2017, subject to a 6% interest rate, although a benefit award entered after the effective date may relate back to events that occurred prior to the effective date of the statutory amendment.

23. MOHAMMAD ALI IQTAIFAN V.
TARA W. HAGERTY, IN HER OFFICIAL
CAPACITY AS JEFFERSON CIRCUIT
COURT JUDGE, ET AL.

2020-SC-0304-MR TO BE PUBLISHED COURT OF APPEALS

### OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE LAMBERT - <u>AFFIRMING</u> <u>AND REMANDING</u>

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

### **Questions Presented:**

Family Law. Foreign Judgments. Writ of Mandamus. Opinion of the Court affirming the Court of Appeals' denial of a writ of mandamus against family court judge for failure to dismiss a petition for dissolution of marriage on grounds that the parties were already divorced under the laws of the Kingdom of Jordan. Court held that appellant/real party in interest was not entitled to writ relief of any kind, and specifically held that the family court was not acting outside its jurisdiction by not automatically giving full faith and credit to a divorce decree from a foreign country under the Full Faith and Credit Clause of the United States Constitution. Family court had jurisdiction and discretion to grant comity to the foreign decree, if appropriate in the judgment of the family court.

24. HAROLD EUGENE HAYES **V.** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2019-SC-0486-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

**PERRY** 

25. MARGIE J. JOHNSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. CONLEY, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.

2019-SC-0567-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED LOGAN

26. FARAND SKINNER V. **BRECKINRIDGE** 2019-SC-0589-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE **COURT - AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. 27. JOHN BANNON V. FORD MOTOR CO., 2019-SC-0718-WC **COURT OF** ET AL. NOT TO BE PUBLISHED **APPEALS** MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE **COURT - AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; CONLEY, HUGHES, NICKELL AND VANMETER, JJ., CONCUR. LAMBERT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH

28. LORI C. MATTIE V.

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE
COURT - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

WHITLEY
NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

#### **OPINION AND ORDERS - February 18, 2021**

KELLER, J., JOINS.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

RACHELLE NICHOLE HOWELL V. 2020-SC-0608-KB IN SUPREME KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION TO BE PUBLISHED COURT OPINION AND ORDER GRANTING REINSTATEMENT

### EXPEDITED ORDER GRANTING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW (NO ORAL ARGUMENT) - February 09, 2021

HEATHER LERAE MOORE **V.** EDDIE DEAN <u>2020-SC-0553-DGE</u> WHITLEY MOORE

M. A. B. **V.** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, <u>2020-SC-0572-DGE</u> BARREN CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES

### ORDER GRANTING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW (ORAL ARGUMENT) - February 09, 2021

PRIMAL VANTAGE COMPANY, INC. **V.** <u>2020-SC-0247-DG</u> JEFFERSON KEVIN O'BRYAN, ET AL.

### ORDER GRANTING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW (NO ORAL ARGUMENT) - February 09, 2021

JOHN BRUNER, ET AL. V. DON COOPER, ET AL. <u>2020-SC-0426-DG</u> PULASKI

#### ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - February 09, 2021

CITY COMMISSION OF BOWLING GREEN, <u>2020-SC-0134-D</u> WARREN KENTUCKY **V.** MFG CUMBERLAND TRACE, LLC,

ET AL.

CHARLES V. NUNN, ET AL. V. FEDERAL 2020-SC-0155-D SHELBY

NATIONAL MORTGAGE ASSOCIATION, ET AL.

RONALD COPLEY V. COMMONWEALTH OF 2020-SC-0164-D RUSSELL

KENTUCKY

CHARLES MUCKER V. CHRISTOPHER CRIBBS. 2020-SC-0210-D FRANKLIN

ET AL.

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - February 09, 2021			
BILLY D. BOWLING V. MAMMOTH CAVE ADVENTURES, LLC	2020-SC-0213-D	BARREN	
TINA JEWELL, ADMINISTRATRIX FOR THE ESTATE OF KEVIN JEWELL, ET AL. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY TRANSPORTATION CABINET, ET AL.	2020-SC-0224-D	HARLAN	
JENNIFER MCKIM, EXECUTRIX OF THE ESTATE OF HENRY D. MCKIM V. ZHENG PING FU KELLER, J., WOULD GRANT DISCRETIONARY REVIEW.	<u>2020-SC-0225-D</u>	JEFFERSON	
DIANA DETERS <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY TOURISM, ARTS AND HERITAGE CABINET, ET AL.	2020-SC-0234-D	FRANKLIN	
ROSCOE BEARD, ET AL. V. G. E. GRAY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0249-D	TAYLOR	
AHLIJIA MARQUISE GAILES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	<u>2020-SC-0256-D</u>	HARDIN	
BARRY P. MCNEES, ET AL. V. RC NASSAR, LLC	2020-SC-0270-D	FAYETTE	
ANTHONY BROWN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0293-D	CAMPBELL	
RYAN S. HUBBARD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0297-D	JEFFERSON	
LEO CORNELIUS SPURLING V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0302-D	LYON	
FREEDA M. LOUTHAN V. DOLLAR BANK, FSB, ET AL.	2020-SC-0369-D	JEFFERSON	

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - February 09, 2021			
FREEDA M. LOUTHAN V. MCKENZIE BANKING COMPANY, ET AL.	<u>2020-SC-0373-D</u>	JEFFERSON	
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT CABINET, DEPARTMENT FOR NATURAL RESOURCES V. J.D. CARTY RESOURCES, LLC, ET AL.	<u>2020-SC-0378-D</u>	MAGOFFIN	
ALVIN CRASK V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY EX REL. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES	<u>2020-SC-0396-D</u>	JEFFERSON	
JAMES LATTANZIO, ET AL. V. SCOTT KELLER, ET AL.	2020-SC-0409-D	FAYETTE	
ANDREW S. WALKER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	<u>2020-SC-0417-D</u>	JEFFERSON	
JESSICA MICHELLE HEADY MAUPIN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0424-D	JEFFERSON	
DAMON L. GLENN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0428-D	JEFFERSON	
RANDALL KIPER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0432-D	JEFFERSON	
RONALD C. FAIRCHILD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	<u>2020-SC-0442-D</u>	ROWAN	
MICHAEL O'CONNELL V. CHRISTOPHER THIENEMAN	<u>2020-SC-0453-D</u>	JEFFERSON	

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - February 09, 2021			
PROMISE WILCOX V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0454-D	JEFFERSON	
FRANK COLEMAN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0457-D	HARDIN	
A. S. V. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0459-DE	FAYETTE	
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. MARK MCKENZIE	2020-SC-0462-D	MCCRACKEN	
JANTZEN KNIGHT BRICKEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0465-D	MCCRACKEN	
DAVID WAYNE FERGUSON V. TERESA LEAH FERGUSON	2020-SC-0466-DE	MEADE	
MARIE OSTENDORF V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0475-D	KENTON	
JEFFREY G. STAGNARO, ADMINISTRATOR OF THE ESTATE OF DAVID BOUMA V. STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE COMPANY	2020-SC-0476-D	CAMPBELL	
PENNIE A. DETORRES V. JOHN G. DUBARRY	2020-SC-0484-D	JEFFERSON	
JOHN R. CECIL, JR. <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0489-D	JEFFERSON	

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - I	<u> February 09, 2021</u>	
K. D. S. V. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES, COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0493-DE	SCOTT
BRACKEN COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION <b>V.</b> AUGUSTA INDEPENDENT BOARD OF EDUCATION, ET AL.	2020-SC-0500-D	FRANKLIN
KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS V. JANET MCKNIGHT CONLEY, J., WOULD GRANT DISCRETIONARY REVIEW.	<u>2020-SC-0507-D</u>	FRANKLIN
LESTER KEITH HURT V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0508-D	PERRY
JAMES POPE WOOLFOLK <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0509-D	FAYETTE
S. B. AND E.B. V. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES, COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0511-DE	JEFFERSON
DEVONTE WEBB V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0522-D	FAYETTE
AHMAD M. QASEM V. TINA A. QASEM	2020-SC-0531-DE	PULASKI
A. S. V. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0536-DE	FAYETTE
BRAY A. NELSON <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0582-D	BOONE

# COPPAGE CONSTRUCTION COMPANY, INC. V. 2020-SC-0197-D KENTON SANITATION DISTRICT NO. 1, ET AL. KELLER, J., WOULD GRANT DISCRETIONARY REVIEW.

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW AND DEPUBLISHING - February 09, 2021

WILLIAM L. HOLDER	V PARAGON HOMES	INC	2020-SC-0235-D	JEFFERSON
WILLIAM L. HOLDLK	VI TIMOUN HOMES	, 1110.	2020-BC-0233-D	JLIILISON

MARK SAUNIER, ET AL. V. <u>2020-SC-0242-D</u> FAYETTE LEXINGTON CENTER CORPORATION, ET AL. **LAMBERT, J., NOT SITTING.** 

PETITION FOR REHEARING DENIED - February 18, 2021			
CHAZERAE ME'LON TAYLOR, SR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY AND	2019-SC-0066-MR	FAYETTE	
CHAZERAE MEL'ON TAYLOR, SR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	<u>2019-SC-0138-TG</u>	FAYETTE	
DAWAN Q. MULAZIM V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	<u>2018-SC-0466-MR</u>	FAYETTE	
SHAYNA HUBERS V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ORDER DENYING REHEARING AND MODIFYING OPINION	2018-SC-0667-MR	CAMPBELL	
UPPER POND CREEK VOLUNTEER FIRE DEPARTMENT, INC. V. RONNIE KINSER, ET AL.	2019-SC-0563-DG	PIKE	
ORDER GRANTING EXTENSION AND MODIFYING - February 18, 2021			
EDWARD ELDER <b>V.</b> KENTUCKY RETIREMENT SYSTEMS	2017-SC-0258-DG	FRANKLIN	
ORDER GRANTING EXTENSION AND			

**SUBSTITUTING OPINION** 

ORDER DENYING TRANSFER - February 18, 2021

BINGHAM GREENEBAUM DOLL, LLP V. MEREDITH L. LAWRENCE, ET AL.

2020-SC-0455-T

**GALLATIN** 

ORDER DISMISSING - February 04, 2021

RAYMOND DESHAWN WILSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2020-SC-0481-D

**FAYETTE** 

ORDER DISMISSING DUE TO DEFICIENCY

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

JOHN MCGUFFIN V.

2020-SC-0568-D

**GRAYSON** 

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DISMISSING DUE TO DEFICIENCY

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

DARRIN DWAIN MORTON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY 2020-SC-0586-MR

LOGAN

DISMISSED PER ORDER DENYING TRANSFER

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ.. SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

RAYMOND WEATHERLY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2020-SC-0594-MR

**FULTON** 

DISMISSED PER ORDER DENYING TRANSFER

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

PEGGY COFFEY V. KMART, ET AL.

2020-SC-0240-WC

COURT OF APPEALS

JOINT MOTION OF THE PARTIES TO DISMISS IS GRANTED

IS GRANTED

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

### ORDER DISMISSING - February 04, 2021

RODGER LEE COX V. COMMONWEALTH OF	2020-SC-0555-D	MARION
KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0365-D	TAYLOR

### ORDER GRANTING MOTIONS TO WITHDRAW MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

### ORDER WITHDRAWING FROM KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION - February 03, 2021

JENNIFER HAGEMAN V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION	2021-SC-0043-KB	IN SUPREME COURT
RANDALL STEPHEN JACKSON, JR. V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION	2021-SC-0044-KB	IN SUPREME COURT